

Date 2005-11-23	Document PC57.131 – Draft 1 September 27, 2005
--------------------	--

Num	Voting Member	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph Figure/ Table	Type of comment (General/ Technical/ Editorial)	COMMENTS	Proposed change	Observations of Working Group on each comment submitted
1	Traub	3.36		General	The term “reversing change-over selector” does not exist in C57.12.80.	Change this term to “change-over selector” to agree with C57.12.80 and with IEC-214. Also, add <i>Syn</i> : Reversing switch.	
2	Traub	3.38		General	The definitions for both “diverter switch” and “selector switch” have <i>Syn</i> : arcing switch	Change the <i>Syn</i> : for selector switch to “arcing tap switch”	
3	Traub	4.3		General	“This means” in the second sentence does not apply to the operation of the LTC	Change to “In addition, LTCs (OLTCs) shall be fully capable of operation under these conditions”.	
4	Traub	5.2.1	Note 2	General	The word “should” should not be used in a standard	Change last part of Note 2 to: “shall be stated in the test report”.	
5	Traub	5.2.4.1	Paragraph 4	Editorial	Typo in second line	“insulated” should be “insulation”	
6	Traub	7.2.2	Paragraph 1	General	The term “maximum rated through-current is referred to, but this term is not defined for a DETC.	Change the term to “rated through-current” (see 7.1.1a)	
7	Traub	7.2.3	Figure 3	Technical	Figure 3 is missing	Add Figure 3 to the document	
8	Alan Darwin	5.2.1	3 rd paragraph on page 11	Technical	With reference to the sentence “ <i>When the surrounding medium is liquid, temperature rise tests shall be performed at ambient temperature.</i> ” Which ambient temperature is to be used? The laboratory air temperature, or the maximum liquid temperature of say 100 °C, or what? The absolute temperature could have an influence on the loss in the contacts as well as on the cooling performance into the liquid.	Clarify which ambient temperature is to be used. If laboratory air temperature, then state this. If not, then identify the correct liquid ambient temperature to use for the test.	

Num	Voting Member	Clause/Subclause	Paragraph Figure/ Table	Type of comment (General/ Technical/ Editorial)	COMMENTS	Proposed change	Observations of Working Group on each comment submitted
9	Alan Darwin	7.2.2	3 rd Paragraph on page 24	Technical	With reference to the sentence " <i>When the surrounding medium is liquid, temperature rise tests shall be performed at ambient temperature.</i> " Which ambient temperature is to be used? The laboratory air temperature, or the maximum liquid temperature of say 100 °C, or what? The absolute temperature could have an influence on the loss in the contacts as well as on the cooling performance into the liquid.	Clarify which ambient temperature is to be used. If laboratory air temperature, then state this. If not, then identify the correct liquid ambient temperature to use for the test.	
10	Alan Darwin	5.2.3	Figure 1 (p14)	Editorial	Figure 1 is missing	Insert figure 1	
11	Alan Darwin	5.2.6.9	Figure 2 (p20)	Editorial	Figure 2 is missing	Insert figure 2	
12	Alan Darwin	7.2.3	Figure 3 (p25)	Editorial	Figure 3 is missing	Insert figure 3	
13	Alan Darwin	Annex A, A.2	Table A.1 (p19)	Editorial	In the column "Switched current", two of the entries have E/F+1 instead of E/R+1	Correct to E/R+1	
14	Dohnal Kraemer	3.38	3 rd line	T	The synonym for "selector switcn" is "arcing tap switch!"	Exchange arcing switch with arcing tap switch	
15	Dohnal Kraemer	5.2.4.1	4 th para, 2 nd line	E	typing error	Exchange "...gas insulated used..." with "...gas insulation used..."	
16	Dohnal Kraemer	5.2.5.1	4 th para, 3 rd line	E	must be read: "The operation of the diverter switch..."	insert of between "operation" and "the diverter switch"	
17	Dohnal Kraemer	7.2.5.3		T	Listing e) from 5.2.6.3 Nature of test (of LTCs) is not applicable to DETCs. Exchange listing e) with that from IEC 60214-1	Exchange the wording in listing e) from "e) Test 5: between diverter switch contacts in their final open position " to "e) Test 5: any distance, that due to the contact configuration will have a higher stress than the ones tested above "	

Num	Voting Member	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph Figure/ Table	Type of comment (General/ Technical/ Editorial)	COMMENTS	Proposed change	Observations of Working Group on each comment submitted
18	Dohnal Kraemer	Annex B	Table B.3, 23 rd line, 4 th column	T	The switched current is determined by the addition of the two terms	Exchange "$1/2I - E_7Z$" with "$1/2I + E_7Z$"	
19	Dohnal Kraemer	Annex C	3 rd definition below the 1 st equation	T	Use the same definition for the coefficient <i>k</i> as in IEC 60214-1, because it is more detailed	Exchange "... of the resistor, the value selected to be between 5 and 10, bearing in mind that the heating phenomena shall remain adiabatic" with "...of the resistor, the value adopted should be below 5. Values between 5 and 10 shall only be used if the heating phenomena remains to be adiabatic."	
20	Dohnal Kraemer	Annex F	[B1]	E	Use the actual version of the IEC tap-changer standard	Exchange "IEC 214 (1989), On-load tap-changers" with "IEC 60214-1 (2003), Tap-changers – Part 1: Performance requirements and test methods"	
21	Phil Hopkinson	7.2.2	1	Technical	Temperature rise limits	Replace temperature rise limit with requirement for successful passing of Functional Life Test, wherein 2 times normal current is passed through contacts for 8 hours on in 130 C oil with 16 hours off. Success is determined by requirement that 30 replications of the test does not result in >25% resistance change and the contacts remain stable.	
22	Phil Hopkinson					Ment that 30 replications of the test do not result in >25% resistance change, and contacts are stable. Note that this could be an added test beyond the 15 C rise limits or could replace the temperature rise test.	

Num	Voting Member	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph Figure/ Table	Type of comment (General/ Technical/ Editorial)	COMMENTS	Proposed change	Observations of Working Group on each comment submitted
23	Les Recksiedler				Separate vessel Oil filled diverter conservator tank	Add a section on the Conservator tank. At laets 12 % volume of diverter vessel. Located separate and at a lower elevation from the main tank conservator so any leakge of oil does not get into the main tank to contaminate it and maks any DBA analysis.	
24	Les Recksiedler				Presure Relief device on spereate vessel oil filled diverter.	Add a section for a Pressure Relief Device to prevent rupture of the oil vessel. Also high enough setting so as to not operate for "normal" operation.	